## PROPOSED PTV SUBSTATION ON ST KILDA JUNCTION

ALTERNATIVE LOCATIONS SUGGESTED BY JAAG AND REASONS FOR PTV REJECTION

Two sites on west side of St Kilda Road South close to Charles Street – too far away, 500m limit to distance from Junction.

<u>In the "dip" at the junction of tram routes at Stop 30</u> –Yarra Trams won't accept use of tram lines for service vehicle access.

<u>Bridging the inbound trench of Queensway parallel to the tram line</u> – as above and potential structural issues.

On the landscaped triangle of land between St Kilda and Punt Roads next to the 7-Eleven service station – Land is owned and reserved by VicRoads and is not available. It is also above a very large water main.

<u>In Albert Park between Queens Road and the Junction Oval scoreboard</u> – ParksVic will not accept any public infrastructure within the park on principle.

Built into the earth bank beside the scoreboard – ditto.

On private land adjacent to the former Cadbury Schweppes building at 636 St.Kilda Road – the owners will not approve the construction of a substation on their land.

The PTV process to date has lacked transparency. Below is a summary:

If the current PTV plans proceed this bulky industrial substation structure is likely to produce a poor urban design and architectural outcome and would obstruct future potential urban design opportunities, which are very much needed for this important gateway to St Kilda and St Kilda Road Boulevard to the CBD.

JAAG has sought support from our State Government Member, Minister Foley, to request that the current proposed Public Transport Victoria (PTV) substation proposed for the landscaped public space at the St Kilda Road South edge to the Junction be reconsidered, with an alternative St Kilda Junction site found, as it appears that PTV are currently not taking into account any form of orderly sense of planning and an eventual Master plan for St Kilda Junction.

- PTV has been planning for the past 2 years a substation located in the landscaped public space at the St Kilda Road South edge to the Junction. PTV has proceeded in this without urban design advice.
- Port Phillip Councillors do not support the current location of the substation.
- Because the substation is of a capacity less than 66,000 volts and is in a Road Zone, a planning permit is not required and Council, is impotent to influence it.
- JAAG, on accidentally finding out in April, 2017 about the proposed substation, insisted with PTV that a community meeting be held to discuss the location of the substation. On May 4, 2017 a community information session was held at which PTV's only discussion was in respect of four

1 of 3 06-Oct-18, 2:17 PM

- alternative external treatments only to the building, but those present, angered at the lack of consultation, unanimously wanted the substation relocated and were not prepared to consider external treatments unless this was done.
- Since the 4<sup>th</sup>May meeting JAAG representatives have met with PTV/EcoDev/Council Officers and suggested other technically feasible locations at St Kilda Junction not previously considered by PTV where a substation could be unobtrusively constructed.
- The week of the 12<sup>th</sup>June, 2017 PTV/EcoDev met with JAAG representatives and a Council Officer to inform us that PTV's investigation resulted in 2 alternatives sites being rejected by VicRoads [as owner of the land]. As VicRoads and Yarra Trams were not represented at the meeting, despite being requested by JAAG to do so, there was no plausible explanation available as to why VicRoads rejected the sites. There has been, and still is, no transparency in the PTV substation site selection process.
- There are other sites that PTV has not pursued investigation of.
- o It appears that PTV is only committed to building the substation location on the landscaped public space at the St Kilda Road South edge to the Junction. The only concession PTV are prepared to make is to engage the services of an architect from a suggested list of Architects/Urban Designers provided by JAAG and Council to work from a Brief which will extend to the finish of the substation as well as its surrounds taking into account its context as one of St Kilda/Melbourne's important gateways. However PTV are not prepared to wait for finalization of such design advice as PTV want to commence immediately the construction of the substation itself with any design features to follow at a later stage.
- Fundamental to this is that the policy of PTV is to use a standardised prefabricated structure, regardless of the local conditions. While this may be inexpensive and suit PTV's technical design objectives, it is not an appropriate way to approach building design for a specific location, especially at a key gateway site that has notable constraints and opportunities around orderly future planning and desirable future character.
- The site chosen by PTV is one of high visibility that may be a critical element in a future design framework for the Junction. The potential role and form of this space in a comprehensive framework should not be pre-empted and hindered by an ill-considered proposal that lacks wider functional and aesthetic design inputs.

Of note is that there has been a deafening wall of silence from the Minister for Transport, the CEOs of PTV and Yarra Trams all of whom were provided on the 9<sup>th</sup> May, 2017 with a petition signed by **147 residents** to request PTV and Yarra Trams consider another appropriate location where the Urban Design Framework is not crippled by a further limiting factor.

Margaret Fitzherbert, State Member for Southern Metropolitan Region, added her voice to the discussion on the St Kilda Junction development and the proposed substation, in Parliament on 10th May. Ms Fitzherbert stated that "Locals have concerns for safety and loss of amenity, and they believe that the structure will be a big, fat graffiti target." Click link to read full transcript St Kilda Junction development

2 of 3





REPORT THIS AD

• Create a free website or blog at WordPress.com.

3 of 3 06-Oct-18, 2:17 PM